11					
1	LEWIS BRISBOIS BISGAARD & SMITH LLP DANIEL V. HYDE, State Bar No. 063365				
2	DANIEL V. HYDE, State Bar No. 063365 BRANT H. DVEIRIN, State Bar No. 130621 633 W. 5th Street, Suite 4000 Los Angeles, CA 90071 Phone: 213-250-1800 / Fax: 213-250-7900				
3					
4	Email: Brant.Dveirin@lewisbrisbois.com				
5	Attorneys for Defendant				
6	Palos Verdes Homes Association				
7	ARMBRUSTER GOLDSMITH & DELVAC LLP DAMON P. MAMALAKIS, State Bar No.: 184489				
8	R.J. COMER, State Bar No.: 186284 11611 San Vicente Blvd., Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 90049 Phone: (310) 209-8800 / Fax: (310) 209-8801				
9					
10	Damon@agd-landuse.com				
11	Attorneys for Defendants Robert Lugliani and Dolores A. Lugliani, as co-				
12	trustees of The Lugliani Trust; Thomas J. Lieb,				
13	Trustee, The Via Panorama Trust				
14	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA				
15	COUNTY OF LOS AN	GELES, CENTRAL DI	STRICT		
16	CITIZENS FOR ENFORCEMENT OF PARKLAND COVENANTS and JOHN A.	Case No.: BS142768			
17	HARBISON,	Assigned for all purpose Hon. Barbara A. Meier.			
18	Plaintiffs,		•		
19	vs.	DECLARATION OF LORE HILBURG IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS PALOS VERDES HOMES ASSOCIATION; ROBERT LUGLIANI AND DOLORES A. LUGLIANI, AS CO-TRUSTEES OF THE LUGLIANI TRUST; AND THOMAS J. LIEB, TRUSTEE, THE VIA PANORAMA TRUST U/DO MAY 2, 2012'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION OR BOTH			
20	CITY OF PALOS VERDES ESTATES, a municipal corporation; PALOS VERDES HOMES ASSOCIATION, a California				
21					
22	corporation; ROBERT LUGLIANI and DOLORES A. LUGLIANI, as co-trustees of				
23	THE LUGLIANI TRUST; THOMAS J. LUGLIANI, TRUSTEE, THE VIA				
24	PANORAMA TRUST U/DO MAY 2, 2012 and DOES 1 through 20,	Action Filed:	May 13, 2013		
25	Defendants.	Trial Date:	None Set		
26	Detenuants.	Hearing Date:	May 29, 2015 9:30 a.m.		
27		Hearing Time: Department:	9:30 a.m. 12		
28					

DECLARATION OF LORE HILBURG IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS PALOS VERDES HOMES ASSOCIATION, ROBERT LUGLIANI AND DOLORES A. LUGLIANI, AND THOMAS J. LIEB'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT OR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION OR BOTH

I, Lore Hilburg, declare and state as follows:

- 1. I am an attorney duly licensed to practice before all courts of the State of California. I am the sole proprietor of the LAW OFFICE OF LORE HILBURG.
- 2. I have been recognized as an expert witness in numerous courts based on my over 30 years of experience in the Title Insurance Industry. I currently serve as a consultant to title companies, title insurers, escrow companies, realtors, property owners and attorneys regarding title, title insurance and escrow issues. A copy of my current Curriculum Vitae is attached hereto as Exhibit B and made a part hereof.
- 3. In my 35 years of working in the Title Insurance Industry, it is often necessary to review chains of recordable documents to decide on the effect of past conveyances and instruments on the ability to convey or use a parcel. I have reviewed hundreds of historic chains of title. In order to determine the intent of a particular conveyance or even a provision in a document, it is necessary to know the context that gives rise to the instrument which can include the use of property at the time, the financial conditions, the law, and the goal of the parties and allow for human error which can result in contradictory, awkward, ambiguous or even mistaken wording. My opinions herein are based on my lengthy experience and knowledge in this area, for which I have had hours of training both in-house with title insurers and through other seminars and lectures that I have attended and that I have given to attorneys and title company employees, underwriters and real estate professionals.
- 4. I was asked to review the chain of title to Area A (as legally described at Evidence in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment or Adjudication ("Plaintiffs' Evidence"), Exhibit 3) to determine which documents affect its title and limit its use. Plaintiffs have focused on the 1940 Deeds and restrictions therein which effectuated the transfer of certain parcels of land in Palos Verdes Estates from the Palos Verdes Homes Association to the City of Palos Verdes, identified as Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibits 6 & 7. However, the 1940 Deeds incorporate the prior "provisions, conditions, covenants and restrictions" and make the 1940 Deeds conveyance and covenants, conditions, and restrictions ("CC&Rs") subject to the earlier ones in their entirety. So the 1940 Deeds must be read, reviewed, and analyzed as part of the earlier rights, powers, goals and

11

12

10

13

14 15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22 23

24

26

25

27

28

property. Moreover, Area A is not a lone parcel. It is part of an overall development. The entire chain of documents makes it repeatedly clear that all of the covenants imposed are done so in the context of an overall plan. Thus, the goal of preserving the nature of the development must be considered when attempting to effectuate a particular provision. Exhibit A, attached hereto, is a table I had prepared which goes through the chain of 5.

plans to arrive at a fair understanding of what the owners of Area A are entitled to do with the

- documents (instruments) applicable to Area A, noting the key provisions I describe and discuss below.
- 6. I began my review with the Declaration of Establishment of Basic Protective Restrictions, Conditions, Covenants, Reservations, Liens and Charges affecting the real property known as Palos Verdes Estates Parcels A and B et al. dated June 26, 1923, recorded July 5, 1923 in Book 2360, page 231 as amended by Amendment No. 1 dated Nov. 26, 1923 et.al. (the "Original Declaration" or "Declaration No. 1"). (Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibit 5 (portions of Declaration No. 1).)
- The preamble of the Original Declaration begins with the declarant stating that it 7. does hereby establish the general plan for the protection, maintenance, improvement and development of the property which is fixed by protective restrictions, conditions and covenants etc. and charges upon all lots for the benefit of the entire property. These restrictions are binding and imposed as a servitude on each parcel. The abhorrent racial covenants at Article I, Section 2, are no longer in effect.
- Article I, Section 4 established the Palos Verdes Homes Association ("Association") 8. and the Palos Verdes Art Jury with the power to interpret and enforce the CC&Rs created by this Original Declaration and all future documents. Many of the restrictions on building and development are akin to zoning regulations. See Article II. This section also sets forth the many broad and specific powers of the Association. See Article II, Section 4. In particular, but not insignificantly, the Association shall have "the right and power to do and /or perform any of the following things, for the benefit, maintenance and improvement of the property and owners thereof at any time:

- a. To maintain, purchase, construct, improve . . . or dispose of parks, parkways, playgrounds, open spaces and recreation areas . . . for the improvement and development of property herein referred to."
 - (i) To acquire . . ., own . . . and to convey, sell, lease, transfer . . . and to otherwise dispose of realty and/or personal property within or without the boundaries of said property.

. . .

(k) To issue building permits for any and all improvements . . . with the powers and rights conferred upon it by virtue of any and all restrictions or contractual agreements . . . which may at any time be placed upon or exist in connection with any of said property . . . and to provide for light, sanitation, health, comfort, and convenience for the occupants . . . by establishing such requirements as are usually included in City housing codes or zoning regulations."

. . .

- (q) To exercise such powers of control, interpretation, construction, consent, decision, determination, modification, amendment, cancellation, annulment and/or enforcement of covenants, restrictions
 . . . imposed upon said property.
- (t) Generally, to do any and all lawful things which may be advisable, proper, authorized and/or permitted by the [Association] ... by virtue of this declaration or of any restrictions, covenants, conditions or laws at any time affecting said property ... (including areas now or hereafter dedicated to public use) ... and to perform ...all acts ... either necessary for or incidental to the exercise of any of the foregoing powers or for the peace, health, comfort, safety, and/or general welfare of owners ...
- (z) To make such agreements with county, township, state, national or

Further, Article IV Zoning, Section 1 provides that "The Protective restrictions in this article shall be known as "Building Zone Restrictions . . ." Area A is a Class F Parcel. Article IV, continues in Section 2: "Class F – Public and Semi-Public Uses" which is further defined in Section 10 to include not only schools, parks, art galleries, or other public or semi-public buildings but also single family residences. Section 16(b) of Article IV allows for accessory buildings on Class F parcels.

- 9. Article VI, Section 11 reiterates and restates the powers set forth in Article II, Section 4(q) which authorizes the Association to interpret and/or enforce any or all "restrictions . . . herein or at any time created . . . In case of uncertainty as to the meaning of said provisions, the [Association] shall in all cases INTERPRET THE SAME AND SUCH INTERPRETATION SHALL BE FINAL AND CONCLUSIVE UPON ALL INTERESTED PARTIES" (emphasis added).
- 10. Amendment 10 to Declaration 20 (which applies to Tract 7330) and Declaration 25 (which applies to Tract 8652), recorded July 26, 1926 in Book 6052, page 86 is the next pertinent document in the chain of title. This document identifies Bank of America as the successor to Commonwealth Trust Company. This amendment confirms the various powers listed in the 1923 document and, in particular, restates Article VI, Section 11 of the 1923 document recited above. This document also designated Lot A as a Class F district. Most of Area A, at issue in this litigation, is located in Lot A.
- 11. The grant deed recorded on January 22, 1931 in Book 10494, page 360, et seq. (the "1931 Deed") is the next instrument in the chain pertinent to this discussion. (Croft Decl., Exhibit B (1931 Deed).) In this conveyance, Bank of America deeds most of Area A (that part contained in Tract 8652) to the Association. Paragraph 2 recites that each and every provision, condition,

restriction, reservation and covenant (which includes the powers of the Association) contained in the Original Declaration and successive amendments thereto "are made a part of this conveyance and expressly imposed upon said realty as fully and completely as if herein set forth in full."

Paragraph 3 reserves the right to "enter upon, develop, plan, improve or maintain" the property.

Section 3 provides that the area is to be used and administered forever as park and/or recreation purposes for the benefit of those residents in Palos Verdes Estates, but under the regulations and subject to the conditions in this deed or set forth in the future by the Association for the purpose of safeguarding the land and protecting Palos Verdes Estates from uses or conditions which may be detrimental to the neighborhood amenities. Section 4 provides for improvements "that are properly incidental to the convenient and/or proper use of the area for park and/or recreation purposes."

Section 5 states that the Association may for the purpose of rectification of boundaries re-convey title of portions of said land to Bank of America or its successors in interest, in exchange for other lands. Under Section 8 it states that all of the conditions, covenants and restrictions are part of the general plan for the improvement and development of the property described and imposed as a servitude on all parcels in the development.

documents. Bank of America grants various parcels to the Association in anticipation of a further grant by the Association to the City of Palos Verdes (the "City"). (Croft Decl., Exhibit C (1940 Bank of America Deed).) In its acceptance of the land, the City, in Section 2, page 11 recites that each and every provision, condition, restriction, reservation and covenant etc. contained in the documents recited and listed herein above, remain fully enforceable and effective as if set forth therein. Paragraph 3 states that the land is to be used and administered forever for park and recreation purposes only as previously set forth in the 1931 Deed. The same language in the 1931 Deed on administering land is repeated here with the addition of allowing for a golf course and club house. The sections on the kind of improvements to be allowed are included from the 1931 Deed with a further limitation on the right to amend the CC&Rs using the votes allowed in the prior declarations. However, since the land is to be owned by the City, it makes sense that the landowners and Association would not have the power to amend the restrictions as they would no

longer own the land. Only the landowner has the power to change the CC&Rs applicable to the land to be burdened. See Cal. Civil Code Sections 804 and 1468. But the right of reverter is fully set forth in the 1940 Deed in the event of a breach, subject to the application of the Marketable Record Title Act (Cal. Civil Code section 880.020 et seq.).

- 13. Lots C and D (designated as the School recreational spaces) came to be owned by the Palos Verdes Unified School District ("District"). (Croft Decl., Exhibit D (1938 Deed).) The District filed a lawsuit against the Association and the City to obtain the right to change the use of Lots C and D so they could be sold to developers. The Association opposed this change because it would adversely affect the general plan of the area. The Association successfully obtained a judgment whereby the court found that a violation of the restriction in the 1925 Declaration and 1938 Deed would cause irreparable harm to the development plan of Tract 7331. (The 1938 Deed is attached as Exhibit D to the Croft Decl.) Further, the Association relied on the Original Declaration.
- 14. In a settlement of said lawsuit, which judgment had then been appealed by all parties, the District conveyed Lots C and D to the Association. (Croft Decl., para. 29.a). The City conveyed Area A to the Association. (Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibit 9.) The Association granted Area A to the owners of 900 Via Panorama, subject to an open space easement and stringent zoning and building restrictions which effectively limited the use of Area A to recreational purposes. (Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibit 10.) Then as part of an exchange (pursuant to the powers granted to the Association in the 1931 Deed), the Association granted Lots C and D to the City so that those parcels would be maintained by the City in conformity with the general plan. (Croft Decl., para. 29.c).
- 15. Once the Association regained ownership of Area A, it had the right to interpret the restrictions consistent with the preservation of the overall general plan or if doing so would advance the interests and overall objectives as set forth in all the conveyancing documents and in consideration of the conditions and circumstances it then faced. (See Croft Decl. para. 22; 34.) Those requirements were met by the easements, regulations, and zoning and building restrictions listed in the deed from the City to the Association (Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibit 9) and from the

Association to the owners of 900 Via Panorama. (Plaintiffs' Evidence, Exhibit 10.) They protect Area A in accordance with the parameters set forth in Declaration Nos. 1 and 25. Whether or not the Association would have expected the restrictions it placed upon the City under the 1940 Deeds to apply to it should it ever reacquire the property in view of the circumstances under which it transferred the property to the City in 1940, the Association would have rightly expected to have the ability, consistent with Declaration Nos. 1 and 25, to interpret the restrictions to serve the community's best interests and undertake appropriate land exchanges and to have that interpretation be conclusive on all interested parties, including plaintiffs.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on May 2.2015, at Los Angeles, California

Lore Hilburg, Declarant

Exhibit A

EXIIO	
Instrument	Key Provisions
Declaration of Establishment of Basic	Article IV, Zoning, Section 10,
Restrictions; Conditions, Covenants,	Business and Public Use Districts, Clas
Reservations Liens and Charges ("Declaration	F sets forth uses allow for Class F
No. 1"), recorded July 5, 1923. (Exhibit 5 to	designated property (including
Evidence in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for	residential uses).
Summary Judgment or Adjudication	Article II, Section 4, Powers of the
("Plaintiffs' Evidence").	Homes Association
	Article VI, Section 11, Interpretation
	and Enforcement by Homes Association
Local Protective Restrictions, Conditions,	Section 2(d) designated Lot A of Tract
Covenants, Reservations, Liens and Charges	8652, which includes most of Area A,
Affecting Real Property known as Tract 8652	as a Business and Public Use District of
("Declaration No. 25"), recorded July 26,	Class F
1926. (Declaration of Sidney Croft in Support	
of Defendants Palos Verdes Homes	
Association, Robert Lugliani and Dolores A.	
Lugliani, as Co-Trustees of the Lugliani Trust	
and Thomas J. Lieb, Trustee, the Via	
Panorama Trust U./DO May 2, 2012	
Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary	
Judgment or Summary Adjudication or Both	
("Croft Decl.") Ex A.)	
Grant Deed, Book 10494, page 360: Bank of	Transferred various tracts, including
America to Palos Verdes Homes Association,	Tract 8652, to Palos Verdes HOA
recorded January 31, 1931 (the "1931 Deed").	Section 5 provides the right of the Pale
(Croft Decl. Ex. B.)	Verdes HOA to enter into exchanges o

DECLARATION OF LORE HILBURG IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS PALOS VERDES HOMES

	Ţ
	this property for other land.
Grant Deed: Palos Verdes Homes Association	Transferred 13 properties (including
to Palos Verdes School District of Los Angeles	Lots C and D of Tract 7331) from the
County ("1938 Deed"), recorded December 7,	Palos Verdes HOA to the District
1938. (Croft Decl. Ex. D.)	
Quitclaim Deed: Bank of America to Palos	Transferred all open space/parkland to
Verdes Homes Association, recorded June 21,	the Palos Verdes HOA
1940 ("B of A Deed"). (Croft Decl. Ex. C)	
Grant Deed: Palos Verdes Homes Association	Transferred certain open space land
to City of Palos Verdes, recorded June 14,	including Tract 7540 (Item 5) from the
1940 ("1940 Deed") (Exhibit 6 to Plaintiffs'	Palos Verdes HOA to the City
Evidence)	
Grant Deed: Palos Verdes Homes Association	Transferred certain open space land
to City of Palos Verdes, recorded June 14,	including Tract 8650 (Item 7(b)) from
1940 ("1940 Deed") (Exhibit 7 to Plaintiffs'	the Palos Verdes HOA to the City
Evidence)	
Quitclaim Deed No. 20121327411: Palos	Transfer of Lots C and D from District to
Verdes Peninsula School District to Palos	Palos Verdes HOA
Verdes Homes Association, recorded	
September 5, 2012 ("2012 Deed"). (Croft	
Decl. Ex. E.)	
Quitclaim Deed No. 20121327412: Palos	Transfer of Lots C and D from Palos Verdes
Verdes Homes Association to City of Palos	HOA to the City
Verdes, recorded September 5, 2012 ("2012	
Deed"). (Croft Decl. Ex. F.)	
Quitclaim Deed No. 20121327414: City of	Transfer of Area A from the City to the
Palos Verdes to Palos Verdes Homes	Palos Verdes HOA (subject to an open

Association, recorded September 5, 2012	space easement in favor of the City)
("2012 Deed"). (Exhibit 9 to Plaintiffs'	
Evidence.)	
Grant Deed No. 20121327415: Palos Verdes	Transfer of Area A from Palos Verdes HOA
Homes Association to Thomas Lieb, Trustee,	to Via Panorama Trust (subject to an open
The Via Panorama Trust U/DO May 2, 2012,	space easement in favor of the City)
recorded September 5, 2012 ("2012 Deed").	
(Exhibit 10 to Plaintiffs' Evidence.)	

DECLARATION OF LORE HILBURG IN SUPPORT OF FACTS IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS PALOS VERDES HOMES ASSOCIATION, ROBERT LUGLIANI AND DOLORES A. LUGLIANI, AND THOMAS J. LIEB'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND/OR ADJUDICATION

The Law Office of Lore Hilburg 1943 Buckingham Road Los Angeles, California 90016 Tel: 323,934,4443

Fax: 323.934.4034 lore@hilburglaw.com

CURRICULUM VITAE of Lore Hilburg

Admitted to practice law - California 1976 - A.V. Rated

More than 6,000 title and escrow claims handled and / or supervised expeditiously, effectively, economically and professionally.

EDUCATION:

Smith College - with Honors 1973 B.A. (Northampton, MA)

Santa Clara University 1976 J.D. Cum Laude

EMPLOYMENT:

Law Office of Lore Hilburg- (1990 - Present)

Consultant: Title Companies, Title Insurers, Escrows, Realtors, Property Owners and Attorneys.

Expert Witness: Recognized by Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino, Ventura, San Luis Obispo, Santa Barbara and San Diego Superior Courts; Federal Court, Central District; and in various arbitration proceedings.

<u>Lecturer:</u> CEB, National Business Institute, Lorman Education Services, Los Angeles County and Beverly Hills Bar Associations, Professional Education Systems, Inc., Fidelity National Title Insurance Company, Land America Escrow Seminars, Santa Clara Co. Escrow Association, San Fernando Valley Escrow Association, Los Angeles Escrow Association, 2000 and 2004 California Escrow Association Convention, Chicago Title Insurance Company Regional Counsel Meeting, California Land Title Association, Stewart Title Guaranty Company Regional Counsel Meeting, First American Title Insurance Company Legal Department Seminar and California State Bar Real Property Retreat 2013

Chicago Title Insurance Company (1988 - 1990)

Vice President and Assistant Manager of Western Regional Claims Department

- . Handled and supervised claims of 4 Western states (CA, NV, AZ, HI).
- Supervised 10 claims handlers.
- . Provided training for title officers, underwriters and claims handlers.
- . Investigated underwriting practices.

Safeco Title Insurance Company (1985 - 1988)

Associate Regional Counsel of Agency Legal Department (1985) Vice President and Manager of Agency Legal Department (1985 -1988)

- . Handled claims of 4 Western States (CA, NV, AZ, HI).
- . Supervised 6 claims handlers and 3 underwriters.
- . Provided training to underwritten title companies.
- . Audited underwritten title companies.
- . Reviewed underwriting contracts.

Nordman, Cormany, Hair & Compton - Oxnard, California (1982 - 1985)

. Business and real estate litigation

Title Insurance & Trust Company - Claims and Litigation (1977 - 1982)

- . Assistant Counsel (1977 1978)
- . Associate Counsel (1978 1979)
- . Supervisor of Claims Los Angeles and Ventura Counties (1979 1982)

Organization Memberships:

2014 - Present:	American Escrow Association
2012 - Present:	State Bar of California: Co-Chair of Escrow and Title Subsection of Real Property Section
2009 - Present:	American Bar Association – Title Insurance Litigation Committee Member
2003 - Present:	Los Angeles Escrow Association: Board member
2001 - Present:	Los Angeles Escrow Association
2001 - Present:	United Trustee Association, formerly known as California Trustee's Association
2001 - Present:	California Escrow Association
1988 - Present:	Los Angeles County Bar Association, Real Property Section: Steering Committee of Title
	Insurance Subsection
1988 - 1990:	Los Angeles County Bar Association: Co-chairperson, Title Insurance Subsection;
1985 - 1990:	Title Insurance Claims Counsel Chair