1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Jeffrey Lewis (SBN 183934) Kelly Broedlow Dunagan (SBN 210852) BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP 734 Silver Spur Road, Suite 300 Rolling Hills Estates, CA 90274 Tel. (310) 935-4001 Fax. (310) 872-5389 E-Mail: Jeff@BroedlowLewis.com  Attorney for Plaintiffs CITIZENS FOR ENFORCEMENT OF PARKLAND COVENANTS and JOHN HARBISON	HE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9	COUNTY OF LOS ANGE	LES – CENTRAL DISTRICT
10		
11	CITIZENS FOR ENFORCEMENT OF PARKLAND COVENANTS and JOHN	) Case No.: BS142768
12	HARBISON,	(Assigned for all purposes to Hon. Barbara A. Meiers, Dept. 12)
13	Plaintiffs,	) PLAINTIFFS' SEPARATE STATEMENT
14	vs.	OF UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT
15 16	CITY OF PALOS VERDES ESTATES, a municipal corporation; PALOS VERDES HOMES ASSOCIATION, a California	CITY OF PALOS VERDES ESTATES' CROSS-MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT, SUMMARY
17	corporation; ROBERT LUGLIANI and DELORES A. LUGLIANI, as co-trustees	ADJUDICATION OR BOTH
18	of THE LUGLIANI TRUST; THOMAS J. S LIEB, TRUSTEE, THE VIA PANORAMA TRUST U/DO MAY 2,	) Hearing Date: May 29, 2015 ) Hearing Time: 9:30 a.m. ) Department: 12
19	2012 and DOES 1 through 20,	) Action Filed: May 13, 2013
20	Defendants.	Trial Date: None Set
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	(1	

Plaintiff hereby submits its Separate Statement of Undisputed Material Facts in opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment or Adjudication:

ISSUE 1: Plaintiffs' First Cause of Action for declaratory relief fails as a matter of law because 1) Area A was validly transferred to the Association by the City's actions; and 2) the City has no affirmative duty to enforce private deed restrictions or to remove "illegal" improvement from Area A.

CITY'S UNDISPUTED MATERIAL	OPPOSING PARTY'S RESPONSE AND
FACTS AND SUPPORTING	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
EVIDENCE	
1. The 1940 deeds that conveyed Area A	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
from the Association to the City ("1940	
Deeds"), provides that a breach of the	
provisions, conditions, restriction,	
reservations, liens, charges and covenants	
set forth in paragraphs 2 to 7, inclusive, shall	
cause the realty to revert to the Grantor.	
Declaration of Vickie Kroneberger	
("Kroneberger Decl."), Exhibits A & B	
thereto.	
2. Area A, the property that is the subject	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
of this litigation, was transferred from the	
Association and accepted by the City in	
1940.	
Kroneberger Decl., Exhs. A & B	

3. Area A, the property that is the subject	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
of this litigation, was transferred from the	
Association to the City in 1940 "upon and	
subject to" seven provisions, conditions,	
restrictions and covenants.	
Kroneberger Decl., Exhs. A & B	
4. Condition number 3 provides in part	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
"said realty is to be used and administered	
forever for park and/or recreation purposes	
only for the behalf of the (1) residents	
and (2) non-resident property owners within	
the boundaries of the property heretofore	
commonly known as "Palos Verdes Estates"	
under such regulations consistent with	
the other conditions set forth in this deed as	
may from time to time hereafter be	
established by said municipality or other	
body suitably constituted by law to take,	
hold, maintain and regulate public parks"	
Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 7; Exh. B,	
pg. 4.	
5. Condition number 4 provides in part that	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
"no buildings, structures or concessions	
shall be erected, maintained or permitted	
upon said realty, except such as are properly	
incidental to the convenient and/or proper	
use of said realty for park and /or recreation	
purposes."	

1	Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9, Exh. B.,	
2	pgs. 5-6.	
3	6. Condition number 5 states "That, except	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
4	in paragraph 3 hereof, said realty shall not	
5	be sold or conveyed, in whole or in part, by	
6	the Grantee herein except subject to the	
7	conditions, restrictions and reservations set	
8	forth and/or referred to herein and except	
9	to a body suitably constituted by law to take,	
10	hold, maintain and regulate public parks;	
11	provided, that portions of said realty may be	
12	dedicated to the public for parkway and/or	
13	street purposes."	
14	Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9; Exh. B,	
15	pg. 5.	
16	7. Condition number 6 states "That, said	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
17	municipality or other body having	
18	jurisdiction may, by and with the written	
19	approval of Palos Verdes Art Jury first	
20	obtained, permit the owner of a lot abutting	
21	on said realty to construct and/or maintain	
22	paths, steps and /or other landscape	
23	improvements, as a means of egress from	
24	and ingress to said lot or for the	
25	improvement of views therefrom, in such a	
26	manner and for such length of time and	
27	under such rules and regulations as will not,	
28	in the opinion of said municipality or other	
	ll	

body and of Palos Verdes Art Jury, impair	
or interfere with the use and maintenance of	
said realty for park and/or recreation	
purposes, as hereinbefore set forth."	
Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9; Exh. B,	
pg. 5.	
8. Condition number 7 states "That none of	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
the conditions, restrictions, covenants and	
reservations set forth in paragraphs 3 to 6,	
inclusive, hereof may be changed or	
modified by the procedure established in	
Section 3 of Article VI of said Declaration	
of Establishment of Basic Protective	
Restrictions, in Section 9 of said	
Declarations Nos. 4, 20, 23, and 24 of	
Establishment of Local Protective	
Restrictions, and in Section 10 of said	
Declaration No. 25 of Establishment of	
Local Protective Restrictions.	
Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9; Exh. B,	
pg. 5.	
9. The 1940 Deeds state "PROVIDED,	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
that a breach of any of the provisions,	
conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens,	
charges and covenants set forth in	
paragraphs 2 to 7, inclusive, hereof shall	
cause said realty to revert to the Grantor	
herein, or its successor in Interest, as owner	

1	of the reversionary rights herein provided	
2	for"	
3	Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9; Exh. B,	
4	pg.5.	
5	10. The 1940 Deeds provides that "the	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
6	disincorporation of the Grantee herein as a	
7	municipality or the dissolution of said body	
8	referred to in paragraph 5 hereof (in the	
9	event of the transfer of any said realty	
10	thereto) shall in like manner cause said realty	
11	to revert to the Grantor herein or its	
12	successor in interest"	
13	Kroneberger Decl., Exh. A, pg. 9; Exh. B,	
14	pg. 6.	
15	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
15 16		Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions,	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land,	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate proceedings by the Grantor herein or its	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate proceedings by the Grantor herein or its successors in interest, or by such other lot	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate proceedings by the Grantor herein or its successors in interest, or by such other lot or parcel owner, and/or by any other person	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate proceedings by the Grantor herein or its successors in interest, or by such other lot or parcel owner, and/or by any other person or corporation designated in said	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	11. The 1940 Deed provides that the "provisions, conditions, restrictions, reservations, liens, charges and covenants shall be covenants running with the land, and the breach of any thereof or the continuance of any such breach may be enjoined, abated or remedied by appropriate proceedings by the Grantor herein or its successors in interest, or by such other lot or parcel owner, and/or by any other person or corporation designated in said Declarations or Restrictions."	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.

	,
12. The City conveyed its interest in Area A	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
to the Palos Verdes Homes Association on	
August 8, 2012, but retained an open space	
easement and a utility easement.	
Kroneberger Decl., Exh. C.	
ISSUE 2: Plaintiffs' Second Cause of Ac	tion for waste of public funds/ultra vires
activity fails because 1) the City possess	es the legal authority both to convey real
property under Gov't Code §37350 and to	enact zoning laws; and 2) Plaintiffs cannot
estop the City from exercising its legislative	ve function in the future.
13. On February 19, 2013 the City's	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
Planning Commission heard and denied an	
application to re-zone Area A from Open	
Space to R1 Single Family Residential and to	
obtain after the fact approval for	
improvements that were placed on Area A.	
Kroneberger Decl., ¶ 6; Second Amended	
Complain ("SAC"), ¶ 34.	
14. On March 12, 2013 the City's Council	Disputed. In fact the City directed staff to
took no action on the application to re-zone	prepare a zone text amendment as set forth
Area A from Open Space to R1 Single	in material fact number 15 below.
Family Residential and to obtain after the	Kroneberger Decl., ¶ 7; see SAC, ¶ 34.
fact approval for improvements that were	
placed on Area A.	
Kroneberger Decl., ¶ 7; SAC, ¶ 34.	
15. On March 12, 2013 via oral vote the	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
City Council directed the City Attorney to	
prepare a zone text amendment that would	

	,
address the use of privately owned OS-	
zoned (open space) property.	
Kroneberger Decl., ¶ 7; see SAC, ¶ 34.	
16. Neither the Planning Commission nor	Undisputed for purposes of this motion.
the City Council has taken any action	
toward Area A since March 12, 2013.	
Kroneberger Decl., ¶ 8.	
Additional Materia	al Facts in Dispute
PLAINTIFFS' UNDISPUTED	OPPOSING PARTY'S RESPONSE AND
MATERIAL FACTS AND SUPPORTING	SUPPORTING EVIDENCE
EVIDENCE	
17. The Association has no current	
ownership of parklands.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 18.	
18. Instead, the City has taken on both the	
ownership of and stewardship of the parks.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 19.	
19. The City has established a Parklands	
Commission.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 20.	
20. Applications by residents that would	
impact parklands are brought to the City's	
Parkland Commission and not the	
Association.	

1	Harbison Decl., ¶ 21.
2	21. Permits and enforcement actions
3	concerning parklands involve the City and
4	not the Association.
5	
6	Harbison Decl., ¶ 22.
7	22. The Association is no longer a body
8	that takes, holds, maintains and regulates
9	public parks and has not done so since
10	1940.
11	
12	Harbison Decl., ¶ 23.
13	23. The June 14, 1940 deeds state that the
14	transferred property "is to be used and
15	administered forever for park and/or
16	recreation purposes"
17	
18	Harbison Decl., ¶ 28; Exhibit 6, p. 7 [June
19	14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract 7540];
20	Exhibit 7, p. 4 [June 14, 1940 deed for Lot
21	A of Tract 8652].
22	24. The June 14, 1940 deeds state that the
23	transferred property "shall not be sold or
24	conveyed, in whole or in partexcept to a
25	body suitably constituted by law to take,
26	hold, maintain and regulate public parks"
27	
28	Harbison Decl., ¶ 30; Exhibit 6, p. 9, ¶ 5
	- 8 -

1	[June 14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract
2	7540]; Exhibit 7, p. 5, ¶ 5 [June 14, 1940
3	deed for Lot A of Tract 8652].
4	25. The June 14, 1940 deeds do not contain
5	any express provision authorizing the City
6	or Association to "swap" parkland
7	properties.
8	
9	Harbison Decl., ¶ 35; Exhibit 6 [June 14,
10	1940 deed for Lot A of Tract 7540]; Exhibit
11	7 [June 14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract
12	8652].
13	26. The June 14, 1940 deeds do not contain
14	any express provision authorizing the City
15	or Association to convey parks as part of a
16	resolution of litigation.
17	
18	Harbison Decl., ¶ 36; Exhibit 6 [June 14,
19	1940 deed for Lot A of Tract 7540]; Exhibit
20	7 [June 14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract
21	8652].
22	27. The June 14, 1940 deeds do not contain
23	any express provision authorizing the City
24	or Association to convey parks to fund
25	budgetary shortfalls for school districts.
26	
27	Harbison Decl., ¶ 37; Exhibit 6 [June 14,
28	1940 deed for Lot A of Tract 7540]; Exhibit
I	0

SROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com

31. The September 5, 2012 quitclaim deed	
states in paragraph 6 that although the	
Panorama Parkland is to remain open space,	
should the owner of the Panorama Parkland	
obtain the necessary permits and approvals	
from the City, Lieb "may construct any of	
the following: a gazebo, sports court,	
retaining wall, landscaping, barbeque,	
and/or any other uninhabitable 'accessory	
structure,'"	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 56; Exhibit 9, p. 2, ¶ 6	
[September 5, 2012 Quitclaim Deed].	
32. The September 5, 2012 quitclaim deed	
states in paragraph 8 that: "This Deed shall	
not cause the Property to be merged with	
any adjacent lot and any such merger shall	
be prohibited."	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 56; Exhibit 9, ¶ 8	
[September 5, 2012 Quitclaim Deed].	
33. Plaintiffs were not a party to the	
September 2012 quitclaim deed from the	
City to the Association.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 56; Exhibit 9,	
[September 5, 2012 Quitclaim Deed].	

34. Thomas J. Lieb is an individual.

Harbison Decl., ¶¶ 59-60; Exhibit 24, pp. 2-	
3 [March 7, 2013 Rocky & Wahl letter];	
Exhibit 23, pp. 1-2 [February 19, 2013 City	
Staff Report to Planning Commission].	
39. The June 14, 1940 deeds state that, with	
written permission from the Association and	
a permit from the City, a property owner	
abutting the park may construct paths or	
landscaping on the conveyed property as a	
means of improving access to or views from	
such property. Such improvements must	
not impair or interfere with the use and	
maintenance of said realty for park and/or	
recreation purposes.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 31; Exhibit 6, p. 9, ¶ 6	
[June 14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract	
7540]; Exhibit 7, p. 5, ¶ 6 [June 14, 1940	
deed for Lot A of Tract 8652].	
40. The face of the 1940 deeds confirms	
that every lot owner in Palos Verdes Estates	
has standing to enforce a breach of the 1940	
deeds restrictions.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 31; Exhibit 6, p. 9, ¶ 6	
[June 14, 1940 deed for Lot A of Tract	
7540]; Exhibit 7, p. 5, ¶ 6 [June 14, 1940	
deed for Lot A of Tract 8652].	

BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com

45. The April 11, 2014 minute order / tentative ruling on the defendants' demurrer to the first amended complaint that was	
adopted as the final ruling of the court	
states:	
"under the authority of the case of Save the Welwood Murray Memorial Library Com., infra, pp. 1017-1018 the court held that although a court cannot generally enjoin a municipality from issuing a legislative act, when it violates its duties as trustee of a public trust (to wit, the trust imposed by accepting land for public use which is restricted in that manner) by not enforcing the restrictions of the deeds or taking steps which would enable or cause there to be violations of restrictions on such donated property, its acts are ultra vires, cannot be deemed legislative in nature, and, accordingly, can be enjoined."	
(Lewis Decl, ¶ 3, Ex. 25, p. 4, li. 27-p. 5 li. 6	
[April 11, 2014 minute order].	
46. The City was a party to the four party	
memorandum of understanding ("MOU")	
that preceded and authorized the 2012	
quitclaim deed.	
Harbison Decl., ¶ 52; Exhibit 12, p. 2 [The	
MOU].	

47. That MOU called for Lieb to pay the

BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com

BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com BROEDLOW LEWIS LLP www.BroedlowLewis.com